



Helen Donaldson <hcd@portlandmaine.gov>

30 Merrill Design Revisions

2 messages

Evan Carroll | Bild Architecture <evan@bildarchitecture.com>

Tue, Oct 18, 2016 at 8:53 PM

To: "Helen (Nell) Donaldson" <hcd@portlandmaine.gov>, Caitlin Cameron <ccameron@portlandmaine.gov>

Cc: Eric Wittman <eric@bildarchitecture.com>, Tom Landry <tomlandry@benchmarkmaine.com>, "Michael (Mike) O Boissonneau" <mboisso1@maine.rr.com>

Nell and Caitlin,

Please consider this email as one of our submission documents.

Our meeting with members of the neighborhood at our office yesterday ended on a positive note. My notes from that meeting are not exhaustive, but are as follows:

Notes on Design Discussion:

- Context sensitivity is a priority
- Shapes of windows
 - Double hung
 - Not patio doors
- Wider entrance door with sidelights
- Could the rear door allow the basement access as well?
 - the front wouldn't have to be fake then
- Main entrance doesn't meet standards
- Verticality of windows vs views
- Sliders on the front don't look good
 - Cheap
 - Not contextual
- consider different Color scheme for bays
- Many really dislike the sliders and railings
- Trim is still desired
- Would be ok with eliminating windows between bay windows
- Vegetation screen on side of building
- Bench/resting space at front entrance
- Support canopy from below instead of above

The attached renderings are the result of those comments and the comments from the planning board. I have discussed the changes in the attached annotations to my self-review.

I am available most times on Thursday and Friday if you would like to meet. I am available from 1pm-4pm on Wednesday.

Thanks to both of you for your work on this site plan approval process.

Sincerely,
Evan

--

Evan A. Carroll AIA, LEED AP, Maine Licensed Architect

Principal

bild ARCHITECTURE

PO Box 8235 Portland, Maine 04104

30 Danforth Street Suite 213, Portland

207.408.0168 - evan@bildarchitecture.com

www.bildarchitecture.com

4 attachments

 **A2.3-RENDERINGS.pdf**
371K

 **A2.4-RENDERINGS.pdf**
281K

 **A2.5-RENDERINGS.pdf**
262K

 **30 Merrill - R-6 Design Standards Self-Evaluation - 9.29.16.pdf**
269K

Helen Donaldson <hcd@portlandmaine.gov>
To: Evan Carroll | Bild Architecture <evan@bildarchitecture.com>

Wed, Oct 19, 2016 at 9:47 AM

Thanks, Evan. I will try to follow up with you today or early tomorrow.

Nell

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Nell Donaldson
City of Portland Planning Division
874-8723
hcd@portlandmaine.gov



10/18/2016 - Summary of changes since planning board hearing on 10/12/16.

- Addition of bay windows.
- Changes to front entrance: Added sidelights, wall lighting, raised platform, benches.
- Addition of metal trellis on elevation facing Cumberland Avenue.
- Adjusted window dimensions to be more vertical and traditionally proportioned.

ingenuity thoughtfulness empathy

R-6 Infill Development Design Principles & Standards

Project Self-Evaluation of Alternative Design Approach

30 Merrill Street

"An applicant may propose an alternative design approach and request an Alternative Design Review. The Planning Authority under an Alternative Design Review may approve a design not meeting one or more of the individual standards provided that all of the conditions listed below are met."

Alternative Design Approach Criteria	Self-Evaluation
A. The proposed design is consistent with all of the Principle Statements.	Yes
B. The majority of the Standards within each Principle are met.	Yes
C. The guiding principle for new construction under the alternative design review is to be compatible with the surrounding buildings in a two block radius in terms of size, scale, materials and siting, as well as the general character of the established neighborhood, thus Standards A-1 through A-3 shall be met.	Yes
D. The design plan is prepared by an architect registered in the State of Maine.	Yes

Principals and Standards	Self-Evaluation
PRINCIPLE A - Overall Context A building design shall contribute to and be compatible with the predominant character-defining architectural features of the neighborhood.	Met All contributing standards are met. Proposal has contributing massing, cornice definition, entrance location, entrance canopy, symmetry, and orientation to the street.
STANDARD A-1 - Scale and Form Relate the scale and form of the new building to those found in residential buildings within a two-block radius of the site, that contribute to and are compatible with the predominant character-defining architectural features of the neighborhood. Special attention shall be given to the existing building forms on both sides of the street within the block of the proposed site.	Met Proposal relates in scale and form to the double-wide triple-decker apartment buildings found adjacent and throughout the neighborhood.
STANDARD A-2 - Composition of Principal Facades Relate the composition of the new building façade, including rhythm, size, orientation and proportion of window and door openings, to the facades of residential buildings within a two-block radius of the site that contribute to and are compatible with the predominant character-defining architectural features of the neighborhood. Special attention shall be given to the existing facades on both side of the street within the block of the proposed site.	Met Proposal façade composition relates to nearby buildings with areas of concentrated windows (like bay windows) and areas of less concentrated windows. Front door is found in traditional location and orientation.
STANDARD A-3 - Relationship to the Street Respect the rhythm, spacing, and orientation of residential structures along a street within a two-block radius of the site that contribute to and are compatible with the predominant character-defining architectural	Met Proposal has traditional relationship to the street.

Project is more like a triple decker than it previously was.

features of the neighborhood. Special attention shall be given to the existing streetscape on both side of the street within the block of the proposed site.	
PRINCIPLE B - Massing The massing of the building reflects and reinforces the traditional building character of the neighborhood through a well composed form, shape and volume.	Met Majority of standards are met.
STANDARD B-1 - Massing The building's massing (as defined by its bulk, size, physical volume, scale, shape and form) should be harmonious with the massing of existing buildings in a two block radius.	Met Proposal compares to triple-deckers and double-wide triple-deckers.
STANDARD B-2 - Roof Forms Roof forms shall refer to the architectural forms found within a two-block radius of the site that contribute to and are compatible with the predominant character-defining architectural features of the neighborhood. Special attention shall be given to the existing roof forms on both side of the street within the block of the proposed site.	Met Proposal compares to triple-deckers and double-wide triple-deckers.
STANDARD B-3 - Main Roofs and Subsidiary Roofs The building shall have a clear main roof form. Subsidiary roof forms and dormers shall be clearly subordinate to the main form in size, space and number. Where a building has multiple rooflines (e.g., main roof, dormer roof, porch roof, etc.) there shall not be more than two roof pitches or outlines overall.	Met Fourth floor roof is subsidiary to third floor roof.
STANDARD B-4 - Roof Pitch Gable roofs shall be symmetrical with a pitch of between 7:12 and 12:12. Hip roofs with a shallow pitch and flat roofs shall have a cornice of at least 12 inches in width. The slope of the roof may be either parallel or perpendicular to the street. Monopitch (shed) roofs are allowed only if they are attached to the wall of the main building. No mono pitch roofs shall be less than 7:12, except for porch roofs. There is no minimum pitch for porch roofs.	Met Flat roof is less than 7:12.
STANDARD B-5 - Facade Articulation Provide variety in the massing by incorporating at least two or more of the following architectural elements. Such features shall be applied to the front façade and those portions of the building that are readily visible from the public way. 1. Gables or dormers. 2. Balconies. 3. Recessed entries. 4. Covered porches, covered entries or stoops. 5. Bay windows. In the case of horizontally attached dwelling units, at least one-half of the ground floor units shall have a bay window to receive credit as a design feature.	Met Provided: - Recessed entries - Covered entry - Bay windows added
STANDARD B-6 - Garages Attached and detached garages are allowed provided that the street-facing façade of the garage is recessed behind the façade of the main structure by a minimum of four feet. However, if the garage is integrated into the building form, the garage door may be included into the front	Met There is no garage door.

<p>façade of the dwelling providing that there are at least one story of living space over the garage. In this instance, the garage door width may be no more than 40% of the width of the building's overall façade width, except that no garage door need be reduced to less than 9 feet in width. Standard C-2 is not required if there is no living space on the ground level.</p>	
<p>PRINCIPLE C - Orientation to the Street The building's façade shall reinforce a sense of the public realm of the sidewalk while providing a sense of transition into the private realm of the home.</p>	<p>Met Majority of standards are met.</p>
<p>STANDARD C-1 - Entrances Emphasize and orient the main entrance to the street. The main entrance of the structure shall either face the street and be clearly articulated through the use of architectural detailing and massing features such as a porch, stoop, portico, arcade, recessed entry, covered entry, trim or be located on the side and be accessed by a covered porch that extends to the front of the building, at the primary street frontage.</p>	<p>Met Pedestrian and bike entrance faces street, is centered, is recessed, is highlighted with color, and is covered by a canopy. Added sidelights, wall lighting, raised platform, benches.</p>
<p>STANDARD C-2 - Visual Privacy Ensure the visual privacy of occupants of dwellings through such means as placing the window sill height at least 48" above the adjoining sidewalk grade; providing the finished floor elevation of a residence a minimum of 24" above sidewalk elevation; incorporating porches along the front side of the building façade design; or other measures.</p>	<p>Met Dimensional standards are met.</p>
<p>STANDARD C-3 - Transition Spaces Create a transition space between the street and the front door with the use of such features as porches, stoops, porticos, arcades, recessed entries, covered entries, trim, sidewalk gardens or similar elements.</p>	<p>Met Garden provided.</p>
<p>PRINCIPLE D - Proportion and Scale Building proportions must be harmonious and individual building elements shall be human scaled.</p>	<p>Met Majority of standards are met.</p>
<p>STANDARD D-1 - Windows The majority of windows shall be rectangular and vertically proportioned. The use of classical proportions is encouraged. Special accent windows may be circular, square or regular polygons. Doorways, windows and other openings in the façade (fenestrations) shall have a proportional relationship to the overall massing of the building.</p>	<p>Windows are now vertically proportioned.</p>
<p>STANDARD D-2 - Fenestration Doorways, windows and other openings (fenestration) shall be scaled appropriately to the overall massing of the building. The area of fenestration of the front façade (and for corner lots, both street-facing facades) shall be at least 12% of the total facade area. Appropriately scaled windows or other building openings shall be included on all sides of a building.</p>	<p>Met Minimum fenestration met.</p>
<p>STANDARD D-3 - Porches When porches are attached to the front facade, [or for porches that are required as an open space amenity under Section 14-139(f)] the porches shall extend along a horizontal line at least 20% of the front façade. Porches and balconies must have a minimum depth of 6 feet and a minimum square footage of 48 square feet. The depth may be reduced to</p>	<p>Met If front entry is considered a porch than it meets the dimensional standards. If it is not considered a porch than porches are not required and standard is met.</p>

5 feet provided that the square footage is increased to 60 square feet.	
PRINCIPLE E - Balance The building's façade elements must create a sense of balance by employing local or overall symmetry and by appropriate alignment of building forms, features and elements.	Met Majority of standards are met.
STANDARD E-1 - Window and Door Height The majority of window's and door's head heights shall align along a common horizontal datum line.	Met
STANDARD E-2 - Window and Door Alignment The majority of windows shall stack so that centerlines of windows are in vertical alignment.	Met
STANDARD E-3: - Symmetricality Primary window compositions (the relationship of two or more windows) shall be arranged symmetrically around the building façade's centerline (overall symmetry) or around another discernable vertical axis line.	Met
PRINCIPLE F - Articulation The design of the building is articulated to create a visually interesting and well composed residential façade.	Met Majority of standards are met.
STANDARD F-1 - Articulation Buildings shall provide surface articulation by employing such features such as dimensional trim, window reveals, or similar elements appropriate to the style of the building. Trim and details shall be designed and detailed consistently on the facades visible from the public right of way.	Met Proposal is articulated using metal fabrications such as railings and canopies as is appropriate to the style of the building.
STANDARD F-2 - Window Types Window patterns shall be composed of no more than two window types and sizes except where there is a design justification for alternate window forms..	Met Window types are limited and justified.
STANDARD F-3 - Visual Cohesion Excessive variations in siding material shall not be allowed if such changes disrupt the visual cohesion of the façade. Materials shall be arranged so that the visually heavier material, such as masonry or material resembling masonry, is installed below lighter material, such as wood cladding.	Met Materials are used in a visually cohesive manner.
STANDARD F-4 - Delineation between Floors Buildings shall delineate the boundary between each floor of the structure through such features as belt courses, cornice lines, porch roofs, window head trim or similar architectural features.	Met Floor delineation is clearly identified by the aligned heads of windows and doors.
STANDARD F-5 - Porches, etc. Porches, decks, balconies, stoops and entryways shall be architecturally integrated into the overall design of the building in a manner that compliments its massing, material, and details. Multilevel porches and balconies on front facades shall not obscure the architectural features of the façade. Use of rail/baluster systems with appropriate openings between rails, stepping back balconies from the front plane of the building face, or other appropriate design features shall be employed to achieve this standard.	Met Canopy and railing features are related to each other with color and detailing.
STANDARD F-6 - Main Entries Main entries shall be emphasized and shall be integrated architecturally	Met Pedestrian and bike entrance

into the design of the building, using such features as porch or stoop forms, porticos, recessed entries, trim or a combination of such features, so that the entry is oriented to the street.	faces street, is centered, is recessed, is highlighted with color, and is covered by a canopy.
<p>STANDARD F-8 – Articulation Provide articulation to the building by incorporating the following architectural elements. Such features shall be on all façades facing and adjacent to the street.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Eaves and rakes shall have a minimum projection of 6 inches. 2. All exterior façade trim such as that used for windows, doors, corner boards and other trim, shall have a minimum width of 4 inches except for buildings with masonry exteriors. 3. If there are off sets in building faces or roof forms, the off sets shall be a minimum of 12 inches. 4. Pronounced and decorative cornices. 	
<p>PRINCIPLE G - Materials Building facades shall utilize appropriate building materials that are harmonious with the character defining materials and architectural features of the neighborhood.</p>	<p>Met Majority of standards are met.</p>
<p>STANDARD G-1 - Materials Use materials and treatments for the exterior walls (including foundation walls) and roofing that are harmonious with those in buildings within a two-block radius of the site that contribute to and are compatible with the predominant character- defining architectural features of the neighborhood. Special attention shall be given to the existing building forms on both sides of the street within the block of the proposed site.</p>	<p>Met Proposal utilizes clapboard siding, vinyl windows, concrete foundation and metal railings as can be found in the immediate neighborhood.</p>
<p>STANDARD G-2 - Material and Façade Design The selection of façade materials shall be consistent with the façade design and appropriate to their nature. For example, brick facing should not appear to be thin layers on the façade, or to overhang without apparent support.</p>	<p>Met</p>
<p>STANDARD G-3 - Chimneys Chimneys shall be of brick, finished metal, stone or boxed- in and clad with materials to match the building.</p>	<p>Met No chimney is provided.</p>
<p>STANDARD G-4 - Window Types A variety of window treatments and skylights are acceptable. However, within a single building the types of windows shall be limited to two types, and window detailing shall be consistent throughout.</p>	<p>Window types are limited and justified.</p>
<p>STANDARD G-5 - Patios and Plazas Patios and plazas shall be constructed of permanent materials such as concrete, brick or stone.</p>	<p>Met</p>